

‘Impermanence’: A Translation of the First Chapter of the Tibetan *Udānavarga*

PETER SKILLING (BHADRA RUJIRATHAT)

Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok

The *Udānavarga* is a grand compendium of Buddhist verse, compiled by a Dharmatrāta about whom we know next to nothing. In Sarvāstivādin and Mūlasarvāstivādin circles the *Udānavarga* was as popular as is the *Dhammapada* in Theravādin circles, and it circulated widely in South and Central Asia. Here I give an English translation from the Tibetan of the first chapter, ‘Impermanence’.

Dedication

This translation is dedicated to the memory of those who were themselves dedicated heart and soul to the study of Buddhist knowledge but left us too soon. I am grateful to them all for sharing their wisdom with me:

Sarah Boin-Webb, 1937–2008
E. Gene Smith, 1936–2010
Michael Hahn, 1941–2014
Hubert Durt, 1936–2018
Yuyama Akira 1935–2019
Seishi Karashima, 1957–2019
Stefano Zacchetti, 1968–2020
Kun Sopheap, 1956–2020

Prelude

In December 2010, I learned that Gene Smith, peerless master of Tibetan wisdom and scholarship, had died.¹ *Samvega* carried me to the shrine room where I sat down and began to translate the ‘Chapter on Impermanence’ of the *Udānavarga*. I finished a draft version but wanted to compare the Tibetan and Sanskrit versions more closely. My attention turned to other matters and the translation lay untended.

1. ‘Jam dbyangs rnam rgyal, 1936–2010.

Keywords: *Udānavarga*, Tibetan translation, Buddhist verse, impermanence and death

Further *saṃvega* stirred me when Michael Hahn, Hubert Durt, and Seishi Karashima passed away in the intervening years. Last year, when I turned seventy, I decided that it was time to finish and publish the translation. Time does not stand still and on 30 April, 2020, news came that Stefano Zacchetti, embodiment of generosity, good humour, and deep knowledge, had died in Oxford at the young age of fifty-two. Not long afterwards, on 4 May, I learned that Kun Sopheap, unsurpassed savant of Khmer Buddhist culture, had passed away in Phnom Penh.

The ‘Chapter on Impermanence’ is not a cheery chapter. The verses, illustrated by poignant similes, ask us to face what we don’t like to face: our mortality, the brute realities of impermanence and death. Today the world is passing through difficult and uncertain times, and the ‘Chapter on Impermanence’ has become uncomfortably relevant. Reading the verses encourages us to reflect on how old age and death are part and parcel of life and on how they are not things to abhor and fear but natural inevitabilities to accept and understand. In turn, understanding and wisdom can help us achieve fearlessness and inner balance.

Introduction

In 1965–68, Franz Bernhard (b. Silesia, 1931, d. Mustang, 1971) published an extraordinary work of scholarship in which he patiently collated hundreds of manuscript fragments from the Pelliot (Paris), Stein (London), and Turfan (Berlin) collections to recreate a nearly complete Sanskrit text of the *Udānavarga* (a task begun under one of his teachers, Ernst Waldschmidt, 1897–1985). In 1990, Siglinde Dietz and Champa Thupten Zongtse published a critical edition of the Tibetan *Udānavarga*, consulting over a dozen xylograph and manuscript *Kanjurs* and *Tanjurs*. The Tibetan was translated about CE 800 by the Indian preceptor Vidyāprabhākara with the Tibetan translator Rin chen mchog, and revised by Dpal brtsegs.

In 1970, Lambert Schmithausen published the results of his formidable research on the transmission of the *Udānavarga* and convincingly demonstrated that there are two distinct recensions of the *Udānavarga*, one represented today by the majority of the Sanskrit manuscripts from Central Asia and the other by quotations in the *Yogācārabhūmi*, some of the Central Asian manuscripts, and the Tibetan translation.² The Tibetan translation is the only complete witness to this recension. It is a translation, a version, a recension, but it is a literary work in its own right, and ever since its translation it has had its own existence independent of the ‘original’ Sanskrit. In order to understand the historical depth of a work, we rummage through manuscript fragments and parallel texts, raising hypotheses and sometimes wandering afield in quest of elusive Ur-texts. Ironically, comparative philology can cause us to lose sight of the value of the individual text or recension as an organic whole.

From the outset I chose to translate the Tibetan version as the primary text. By doing so I am translating Recension 2, which according to Schmithausen is associ-

2. I do not take into account the Chinese translation, Taishō 213, the *Fa ji yao song jing* 法集要頌經, translated in 985 by the Indian monk Tian xi zai 天息災, for which see Willemsen, *A Collection of Important Odes of the Law*.

ated with the Mūlasarvāstivādins.³ My translation is based on Dietz and Zongtse's model edition of the Tibetan version, in close comparison with the Sanskrit of Bernhard's meticulous edition of the fragments. The numbering of the verses follows the Tibetan.

Bernhard's edition contains 1050 verses, including verse summaries or *uddānas*. The Tibetan in Dietz and Zongtse's edition counts 1020, plus 3 *uddānas*. The collection is divided into thirty-three chapters (*varga*, *tshoms*), each with a thematic title. Here I translate the first chapter, 'Impermanence' (*Anityavarga*, *Mi rtag pa'i tshoms*) which has 42 stanzas in Sanskrit and 43 in the Tibetan. This count, however, includes two introductory stanzas penned by the compiler, so a more realistic count of 'canonical' stanzas is 40 and 41.

As a collection, an anthology of verses, the *Udānavarga* is not an original work, but a compilation from a large number of other works, which Bernhard painstakingly traces in his apparatus and concordances. For the 'Chapter on Impermanence' alone, Bernhard gives parallels in the Pali *Dhammapada* and the Khotan (Gandhari) *Dharmapada*, the Pali and Sanskrit *Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra*, Sanskrit texts like the *Avadānaśataka*, *Divyāvadāna*, *Mahākarmavibhaṅga*, and *Mahāvastu*, the Pali *Dīghanikāya*, the *Saḡāthāvagga* of the *Samyuttanikāya*, the *Suttanipāta*, *Thera-* and *Therī-gāthā*, *Udāna*, *Itivuttaka*, and *Jātaka*, the last six belonging to the *Khuddakanikāya*, along with the *Nettipakaraṇa*. To these further references can be added in Buddhist Sanskrit and Tibetan (for example, the *Muktaka* of the *Vinayottaragrantha* of the Mūlasarvāstivādins, Śamathadeva's *Upāyikāṭikā*, Vasubandhu's *Vyākhyāyukti*, Bhāviveka's *Tarkajvālā*, and the *Gāthāsaṃgraha* attributed to Vasubandhu). Buddhist studies have not stood still since 1965, and 'new' and newly identified manuscript fragments can now be added, such as the Buddhist Sanskrit *Abhisamācārikā*. We can add Kumārajīva's *Da zhidu lun*, and I do not doubt that a large number of texts in Chinese contain or cite *Udānavarga* verses, not to mention citations in Tibetan works like Gampopa's *Jewel Ornament of Liberation*.⁴ For centuries, for a millennium and more, the *Udānavarga* was a prime source book for Buddhists across Asia. The complicated intertextuality of Buddhist canonical literature is seen in the fact that these parallels are rarely exact counterparts; there are always variants, even within the same *Vinaya* lineage, and many of them are simply single lines rather than complete verses.⁵

The *Udānavarga* may originally have been redacted in Prakrit and the original title was probably simply *Udāna*; that is, the collection was meant to represent the *udāna* of the twelve *āṅgas*. Whatever the case, I continue to use the title *Udānavarga* to avoid confusion with the Pali *Udāna*.

3. Indian Buddhist manuscripts do not identify themselves as belonging to this or that *nikāya*, but it has become the habit, one might say *compulsion*, of modern scholarship to determine the 'school affiliation' of each and every text. This has some value for text-historical study, as long as we bear in mind that the affiliations that we work with are hypothetical.
4. It was Gampopa who first introduced me to the *Anityavarga* and *Udānavarga* when I was reading his *Jewel Ornament of Liberation* in Guenther's translation, first published in 1959.
5. For reference to the parallels, see Bernhard's apparatus. I give only a few, to show how the intertextual relations extend beyond the greater *Dhammapada* literature to *Jātaka* and other genres.

For centuries, after the demise of Buddhism in the subcontinent, the Prakrit and Sanskrit *Udānavargas* were lost in India. Only by the turn of the twentieth century, when European expeditions recovered large numbers of Sanskrit and Buddhist manuscripts from Central Asia and deposited them in the great libraries of St. Petersburg, Berlin, Paris, and London, did *Udānavarga* manuscripts become known to scholars. In 1930, N.P. Chakravarti (1893–1956) published an edition, French translation, and study of a fragmentary manuscript in the Pelliot Collection, Paris. The first English translation of part of the Sanskrit *Udānavarga* was Sarah Boin-Webb’s (1937–2008) rendering of Chakravarti’s edition in French. This was published in instalments in the *Pali Buddhist Review*, the predecessor of this journal.

I have consulted two earlier translations of the Tibetan *Udānavarga*, one by William Woodville Rockhill (b. Philadelphia, 1854, d. Honolulu, 1914), published in 1883, the other by Gareth Sparham, first published in 1983 at New Delhi and reprinted in 1986 by Wisdom Publications, London.

For my translation from the Tibetan, I have compared Bernhard’s Sanskrit edition which often helps to clarify the Tibetan, and I have benefitted from the first complete translation of the *Udānavarga* from Sanskrit into a European language, published in German by Michael Hahn in 2007. The two recensions are parallel developments of the same collection of verses and their ideas and imagery, and although my translation is from the Tibetan I have read the two versions in tandem. That the Tibetan regularly differs from the Sanskrit is not because the translation team interpreted the same text differently but because they had before them a distinctly different recension. Bernhard’s Sanskrit edition and the Tibetan version belong to different transmission lineages, and the differences between the Tibetan and the Sanskrit are *recensional* differences, not questions of interpretation (although interpretation certainly plays a big role in any translation).

I have not attempted to pick and choose the ‘best’ or ‘original’ wording; this would be a misguided effort to ‘normalize’ or ‘correct’ one or the other text or to merge and conflate the two versions.⁶ Taking the Tibetan as my primary text. I have consulted Prajñāvarman’s erudite commentary, the *Udānavargavivaraṇa*, which confirms the readings of the translation.⁷ The internal logic of ideas and the complexity of Prajñāvarman’s comments show that he was working from a manuscript different from that of the Sanskrit.

Prajñāvarman was a Sarvāstivādin master from Bengal; the colophon states that he was a student of the learned master Bodhivarman (**bahuśruta ācārya bodhivarma*) who was born in the land of Kapadhya.⁸ Bodhivarman is otherwise unknown and the

6. With a few small exceptions: for example, the Tibetan has *mi*, ‘man’, ‘person’, where the Sanskrit has *martya* (and Pali *macca*), ‘mortal’, throughout, but I translate it as ‘mortal’, throughout, because it seems especially appropriate in this chapter.

7. Given in colophons as *Slob dpon shes rab go cha* or *Pra dnyā ba rmma*.

8. *Thos pa mang ba’i slob dpon bod hi bar ma*: it strikes me that *thos pa mang ba* translates *bahuśruta* and not *bahuśrutīya*: that is, it is not a reference to the Buddhist school of that name, which scarcely makes sense in the context. According to the traditional lexicons, *bahuśruta* as a personal quality or attainment is *mang du thos pa* while the *Vinaya* school *Bahuśrutīya* is *mang du thos pa’i sde*, *sde* being the usual identifier for schools. *Thos pa mang ba* is also attested for *bahuśruta*.

place name, which is transliterated with some variants, has not been identified. The commentary is reported to be 1,250 *śloka*s long, written in an ‘Indian script’ (*rya gar gyi yi ge*). ‘Indian script’ means very little since several scripts were current in India at the time: to know the script might tell us something about the origin of the manuscript, but this general description does not help with this. Prajñāvarman’s date is not certain; possibly he was active during the eighth to ninth centuries. A Prajñāvarman collaborated on many of the translations of Indian Buddhist texts into Tibetan in the early period; if this was the same Prajñāvarman then he was one of the key figures in the transmission of Indian knowledge to the land of snows.

The colophon gives the names of the translators of the *Udānavargavivaraṇa*: an Indian scholar whose name is variously spelt, in this case, as Paṇḍita Janadhana, but has been interpreted as Janārdana. The Tibetan collaborator was Bhante Śākya Blo gros. Śākya Blo gros and Janārdana were scholars who worked with Rin chen bzang po (958–1055) in Western Tibet and collaborated on translations, including the two other works by Prajñāvarman that are preserved in the Tanjur, his commentaries on the eulogies *Viśeṣastava* and *Devātīśayastotra*.⁹ The decision to translate Prajñāvarman’s sophisticated commentaries shows the high standard of Indo-Tibetan scholarship in Western Tibet in the tenth and eleventh centuries.

Translation

Impermanence

Success!

Cast off drowsiness and dullness, gladden your mind and hearken:

I will proclaim the inspired stanzas uttered by the Victorious One [1]

The all-knowing one, the protector, the compassionate sage,

Who bears his last body, the fortunate one, spoke as follows. [2]

Alas! Composite things are impermanent!

It is their nature to arise and pass away.

Once they arise, they will surely pass away –

Their quieting is happiness.¹⁰ [3]

What pleasure is there? What joy?

In the midst of this blazing fire?

You have plunged into the darkness –

Why don’t you seek out a lamp? [4]

These pigeon-coloured bones

‘Bahuśrutīya’ is a red herring inadvertently let loose by Palmyre Cordier in his *Catalogue du fonds tibétain de la Bibliothèque nationale* (part 3, p. 399).

9. Naudou, *Les bouddhistes Kaśmīriens au Moyen Age*, pp. 158–159. The two *stotra* commentaries have been edited and translated by Johannes Schneider.

10. *Aniccā vata saṅkhārā*, the Pali counterpart of this verse, is commonly recited at funerals in Thailand and Cambodia to the present day, along with verses 23, 24, and 36.

Are all that's left behind,
Scattered every whichaway –
Seeing them, what joy can there be? [5]

From the very first night
That a man enters his mother's womb,
He trudges on without respite –
Once he sets out, there's no turning back. [6]

Out of the many people we see in the morning,
Some won't be seen by nightfall.
Out of the many people we see in the evening,
Some won't be seen the next day.¹¹ [7]

A lot of men, a lot of women¹²
Die when they still are young.
How can mortals be so cocky
About life as to think, 'I am young'? [8]

Some perish in the womb,
Some die at the moment of birth.
Some die when they've just begun to crawl,
Some die when they've begun to walk. [9]
Some when they're old, some when they're young,
Some in the prime of life –
One by one they all pass on,
Dropping like ripe fruits.¹³ [10]

There's always a risk that well-ripened fruits
Will fall down from the tree any time.
Just so there's always a risk
That once a man is born
He may drop dead at any moment.¹⁴ [11]

A potter turns clay into pots,
But in the end they all
Shatter and crumble to dust:¹⁵
Like this is the life of mortals. [12]

It is like this: when the thread of the warp is stretched out

-
11. There is a close parallel in the *Temīya Jātaka*, no. 538, PTS VI, p. 28.4 (v. 118).
 12. The commentary points out that 'men and women' includes everyone: since transgender persons (*ma ning*) are dependent on one or the other of the two, they are included in the two. Or, by including the principal [genders] it is not necessary to mention others: 74.1, *skyes pa bud med ces bya ba 'dir ni thams cad 'dus pa yin te / ma ning ni phyogs gnyi ga la brten pa'i phyir gnyi gas gzung ngo // yang na gtso bo yongs su gzung bas gzhan smos mi dgos pa'i phyir ro*.
 13. This pair of verses is cited in the *Da zhidu lun*, Lamotte, *Traité*, III, 1423, under recollection of death.
 14. There is a close parallel in the *Temīya Jātaka*, no. 538, PTS VI, p. 28.1 (v. 117).
 15. The phrase 'and crumble to dust' is a translator's embellishment added for rhythm and effect. The original has one word, *jig pa = bhedana*.

And the weft is woven through, back and forth
 In the end the thread runs out:
 Like this is the life of mortals.¹⁶ [13]

With each and every step he takes,
 A prisoner condemned to death
 Draws closer and closer to the execution ground.
 Like this is the life of mortals. [14]

As the current of a mighty river
 Rushes on and never turns back,
 Just so our human lives
 Rush on and do not turn back.¹⁷ [15]

Arduous and fleeting,
 Full of suffering,
 Life quickly perishes
 Like a line drawn in water with a stick. [16]

As with his stick a cowherd
 Drives cattle to their pens,
 So illness and old age
 Drive men before the lord of death. [17]

Days and nights pass by,
 And life draws to a close.
 Like water in shallow streams
 The allotted years of mortals evaporate. [18]

Long is the night for the sleepless.
 Long is the mile for the weary.
 Long is rebirth's round for the fool
 Who does not know the Saddharma.¹⁸ [19]

'I have a son, I have wealth':
 So fancies the fool and frets.
 When there is no self, within or without,
 Whose son is it, whose wealth? [20]

16. Bernhard lists only two parallels, one in the Gandhari *Dharmapada* and one from the *Temīya* or *Mūgapaṅkha Jātaka* of the *Mahānīpāta* (*Jātaka* no. 538, v. 105, PTS vol. VI, p. 26.17), *yathāpi tante vitate yaṃ yaṃ dev' ūpaviyati, appakaṃ hoti vetabbaṃ evaṃ maccāna jīvitaṃ*. Brough devotes a long commentary to the verse, *Gandhārī Dharmapada*, X, 13 (149), pp. 222–223. For line *b*, he suggests that *upaviyati* is corrupt; Cone (DOP I, p. 473) appears to support him. Francis, *Jātaka* (1895), p. 16, offers the delightful translation 'As when the lady at her loom sits weaving all the day, her task grows ever less and less, – so waste our lives away'. More recently, less metrically but more accurately, Naomi Appleton renders the stanza in *The Great Birth Stories*, I, p. 76, 'just as when thread is stretched out and woven, what is left to weave decreases, in the same way are the lives of mortals'. The verse is not found in the Pali or Patna *Dhammapadas* and is missing in the Pelliot manuscript edited by Chakravarti.

17. There is a close parallel in the *Temīya Jātaka*, no. 538, PTS VI, p. 26.19 (v. 106).

18. A parallel to v.19 is Pali *Dhammapada* v.60, just as, for example, vv. 26, 36 and 40 have parallels in Pali *Dhammapada* vv. 128, 41 and 287.

Multitudes of men and women
 In the hundreds, in the thousands,
 Amass the goods they yearn to have
 Then fall under the power of the lord of death. [21]

All that you accumulate
 Is exhausted in the end.
 What is raised up falls down in the end.
 Meeting ends in separation,
 And life ends in death. [22]

All sentient beings will die –
 Death is indeed the end of life.
 Their journey onward follows their karma
 And its fruits, good or bad: [23]

Those who commit evil deeds go to hell.
 Those who make merit go to the happy realms.
 On the other hand, there are others
 Who practice the path in this life,
 And, free of impurities, reach nirvana. [24]

Even the buddhas, the autonomous buddhas,
 And the buddhas' auditors –
 All have to give their bodies up.
 How can it be different for ordinary people? [25]

Not in the sky, not in the ocean deep,
 Not hidden in a mountain cleft,
 No spot is there on this earth
 Where you might make a stand
 And not be touched by death. [26]

Whether in the past, whether in the future
 Everyone leaves their body behind and moves on.
 Realizing that everything perishes, the wise
 Stand firm in Dharma and practise the holy life. [27]

Seeing an old man, seeing the pain of the sick,
 Seeing a corpse bereft of consciousness,
 A steadfast one should leave the prison-like household behind –
 How can the worldly give sense pleasures up? [28]

Even gorgeous royal chariots wear out:
 Just so the body succumbs to age.
 The Dharma of the virtuous ones is sublime
 They expound it to good people so that it doesn't age.¹⁹ [29]

19. That is, the Dharma of the teaching does not age because it is transmitted accurately and maintained by good people.

Shame on you, vulgar old age,
 You, who disfigure us!
 You're the one, old age,
 Who wears our beautiful bodies down. [30]

Even if someone lives a hundred years
 Still the lord of death will drag him off.
 Still he'll be struck down
 By old age, sickness and death. [31]

Always moving on, never turning back,
 Degenerating night and day,
 Those suffering from birth and death
 Are tormented terribly, like fish in steaming water. [32]

Throughout the day, throughout the night
 Whether one moves, or whether one stands still,
 Like the current of a mighty river
 Life moves on and never turns back. [33]

Days and nights hurtle by
 And our lives grow shorter and shorter.
 Leaving us stranded like fish in shallow water:
 What joy is there in life?²⁰ [34]

Because the end of life is death
 This nest of old age and disease –
 This body – quickly falls apart
 And this mass of matter bursts. [35]

Alas! It won't be long before this body
 Empty and bereft of consciousness
 Lies stretched out on the earth
 Like a cast-off piece of firewood in a charnel ground. [36]

Constantly tormented by illness,
 Perpetually oozing matter,
 Afflicted by ageing and death:
 Why not let go of this body? [37]

With this very body, leaking pus.
 Fragile and diseased though it be,
 Strive for supreme security
 The unsurpassed accomplishment and joy. [38]

20. There is a close parallel in the *Temīya Jātaka*, no. 538, PTS VI, p. 26.9 (v. 101).

‘I’ll spend the rainy season here,
Here the winter, there the summer.’²¹
Lost in fantasy, the fool
Fails to envisage the dire complications.²² [39]

The lord of death carries away
A man whose mind is attached
To sons and wealth, livestock and property
Just as a flash flood sweeps away
A sleeping village. [40]

Nobody can save you
When the hour of death arrives:
Your children can’t save you
Your father can’t save you, and nor can your relations. [41]

‘When I’ve finished this, I’ll get to that.
When I’m done with these things, I take care of that.’
We worry ourselves and procrastinate like this
Till death along with ageing and illness
Show up and trample us to smithereens. [42]

Therefore: your mind collected, always delight in meditation,
Be ardent and see the last of birth and ageing,
Vanquish the Māras and their troops, O monks,
And cross to the other shore of birth and death.²³ [43]

This completes the chapter on Impermanence.

Acknowledgements

I am indebted to Saerji, Nalini Balbir, Jens-Uwe Hartmann, Olivier de Bernon, and Trent Walker for their help with this article. I thank the Khyentse Foundation for supporting and encouraging my research and translation.

Bibliography

References to Pali texts are to editions published by the Pali Text Society (PTS), UK.

Appleton, Naomi and Sarah Shaw, trans. 2015. *Ten Great Birth Stories of the Buddha: The Mahānipāta of the Jātakatthavaṇṇanā*. 2 vols. Chiang Mai and Bangkok: Silkworm Books and Chulalongkorn University Press.

21. Rainy season, winter, and summer are the three seasons of the north Indian year, which determined the periods of residence for ascetics and monastics.
22. *Udānavargavivaraṇa* remarks that an intelligent person realizes that all sorts of dangers threaten this life, and reflects that those who live [long enough] just to breathe in and breathe out are fortunate. This paraphrases a *sūtra* of which the Pali version is found in the *Aṅguttaranikāya* (III.303–06), trans. Sarah Shaw, *Buddhist Meditation: An anthology of texts from the Pali canon*, Routledge, 2006, pp. 137–139.
23. A Pali counterpart of this verse occurs in *Itivuttaka, Dukaniṭṭhā*, 9, pp. 40–41

- Balk, Michael. 1984. *Prajñavarman's Udānavargavivaraṇa: Transliteration of its Tibetan version (based on the xylographs of Chone/Derge and Peking)*. Indica et Tibetica, Arbeitsmaterialien A. 2 vols. Bonn: Indica et Tibetica Verlag.
- Bernhard, Franz. 1988 (1965). *Udānavarga*. 2 vols. Sanskrittexte aus den Turfanfunden X. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht.
- Chakravarti, Niranjan Prasad. *L'Udānavarga Sanskrit, Text sanscrit en transcription, avec traduction et annotations, suivi d'une étude critique et de planches*. Mission Pelliot en Asie Centrale, Série Petit in-Octavo, Tome IV. Paris: Librairie Orientaliste Paul Geuthner, 1930. [Tome premier (Chapitres I à XXI) – the only tome published].
- Cordier, P. 1915. *Catalogue du fonds tibétain de la Bibliothèque nationale*, troisième partie : Index du Bstan-hgyur (Tibétain 180–332). Paris: Imprimerie nationale.
- Dietz, Siglinde and Champa Thupten Zongtse. 1990. *Udānavarga*, Band III (Sanskrittexte aus den Turfanfunden X, 3). Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht.
- Francis, H. T., trans. 1981 [1895]. *The Jātaka or Stories of the Buddha's Former Births*. Translated from the Pāli by various hands under the editorship of Professor E.B. Cowell. Vol. VI. London: The Pali Text Society, .
- Guenther, Herbert V., trans. 1959. *The Jewel Ornament of Liberation*. London: Rider and Company.
- Hahn, Michael, trans. 2007. *Vom rechten Leben: Buddhistische Lehren aus Indien und Tibet*. Frankfurt am Main and Leipzig: Verlag der Weltreligion.
- Lamotte, Étienne. 1970. *Le Traité de la grande vertu de sagesse de Nāgārjuna (Mahāprajñāpāramitāśāstra)*, III. Louvain: Université de Louvain, Institut Orientaliste (Bibliothèque de Muséon Volume 18).
- Naudou, Jean. 1968. *Les bouddhistes Kaśmīriens au Moyen Age*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Rockhill, W[illiam] Woodville, trans. 1883. *Udānavarga: a Collection of Verses from the Buddhist Canon Compiled by Dharmatrāta being the Northern Buddhist Version of Dhammapada. Translated from the Tibetan of the Bkaḥ-hgyur, with notes and extracts from the Commentary of Prajñāvarman*. London: Trübner.
- Schmithausen, Lambert. 1970. 'Zu den Rezensionen des Udānavargaḥ'. *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens* 14: 47–124.
- Schneider, Johannes, ed., trans. 1993. *Der Lobpreis der Vorzüglichkeit des Buddha: Udbhasiddhasvāmins Viśeṣastava mit Prajñāvarmans Kommentar*. Indica et Tibetica, 23. Bonn: Indica et Tibetica Verlag.
- . ed., trans. 2014. *Eine buddhistische Kritik der indischen Götter: Śaṃkarasvāmins Devātīśayastotra mit Prajñāvarmans Kommentar* (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde, Heft 81). Wien: Universität Wien, Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien.
- Shaw, Sarah. 2006. *Buddhist Meditation: An anthology of texts from the Pali canon*. London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203007310>
- Sparham, Gareth with guidance from Lobsang Gyatso and Ngawang Thekchok. 1986. *The Tibetan Dhammapada: Sayings of the Buddha, a translation of the Tibetan version of Udānavarga compiled by Dharmatrāta*, edited by Beth Lee Simon. London: Wisdom Publications.
- Webb, Sara (Boin), trans. 1981–1982. 'Udānavarga I'. *Pali Buddhist Review* 6(1): 1–4.
- Willemsen, Charles, trans. 2013. *A Collection of Important Odes of the Law: The Chinese Udānavarga, Fa Chi Yao Sung Ching (Taishō 213)*. Berkeley: Institute of Buddhist Studies and BDK America.